

ENTERTAINERS, TEACHERS OR SLAVES? DOLPHINS AND WHALES IN AQUARIA

A SOCIAL STUDIES UNIT

CONTEXT/SETTING

During the last fifty years we have become more and more fascinated by cetaceans (whales and dolphins). At the same time, people's attitudes to these species have changed massively: for centuries, cetaceans were regarded as resources to be hunted for oil, whalebone and other materials, without any consideration for the survival of species or the suffering of individual animals. Now, in societies like New Zealand, over 90 per cent of people believe these animals should not be hunted by humans. This is one of the fastest and most complete changes in attitude towards animals in history. Past and present debates about how we should treat whales and dolphins therefore provide excellent case histories of the development, expression and negotiation of values in societies like ours.

In this unit, students will study the **changing attitudes of people towards the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity**, thereby learning about how changes in scientific knowledge, new media technologies and people's changing perceptions have led to social action and brought about social change.

Resources provided on page 30 can be used for pre-teaching about this issue. During this assessment activity below, students will be required to suggest possible social actions that could be taken to address this issue.

CONDITIONS

The assessed component of this activity, ie, Tasks 1 and 2, is to be completed individually, **under open book test conditions**, in **two hours** of class time. Students may refer to their class notes and other print resources that have been collected by the class or supplied by the teacher. All written material is to stay in the



© Stephen Coburn



© Michael Price

classroom if two one-hour slots are used. Additional time will need to be made available for Task 3: the oral presentations.

RESOURCE REQUIREMENTS

Each student will need a copy of *Animals on Show*, and the Task 1 and 2 Templates. They will also need their own paper and notes.

PRIOR TEACHING AND LEARNING

It is expected that the issue of "people's changing attitudes to keeping dolphins and whales in captivity" will have been presented to and researched and discussed by the class prior to students being set this assessed activity.

Students will have developed a clear understanding of relevant Social Studies **concepts** and **perspectives** that are related to the selected topic.

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON SOCIAL STUDIES PERSPECTIVES AND CONCEPTS

Students will be required to identify and use specific Social Studies concepts relevant to the context of this activity. Guidance regarding the use of Social Studies concepts is available within *Guide notes: Assessment of Concepts in Senior Social Studies*.

These Guide notes can be found on TKI:

www.tki.org.nz/r/ncea/socstud-conceptguidenotes_28feb07.doc

Students will be required to identify and use the perspectives relevant to the context provided in this activity. Guidance regarding the use of Social Studies perspectives is available within *Guide notes: Assessment of the Perspectives in Senior Social Studies*.

The Guide notes can be found on TKI:

www.tki.org.nz/r/ncea/socstud-perspectiveguidenotes_28feb07.doc

Note: Check TKI NCEA support material page for updates.

Students will also need to have knowledge of the steps involved in the Social Decision Making process at **Level 6** of SSINZC and specifically those dealing with Social Action and consequences of Social Action.

ASSESSMENT CRITERIA AS90219 v3 (SOCIAL STUDIES 1.5)

ACHIEVEMENT

- ▶ State possible social actions in relation to a social issue and identify their likely consequences.
- ▶ Identify, with reason(s), the preferred action(s).

ACHIEVEMENT WITH MERIT

- ▶ State a range of possible social actions in relation to a social issue and explain their likely consequences.
- ▶ Identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.

ACHIEVEMENT WITH EXCELLENCE

- ▶ State a wide range of possible social actions in relation to a social issue and explain, in depth, their likely consequences.
- ▶ Identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.

ENTERTAINERS, TEACHERS OR SLAVES? DOLPHINS AND WHALES IN AQUARIA

TEACHING AND LEARNING ACTIVITIES

STUDENT INSTRUCTION SHEET

This activity requires you to:

- ▶ suggest a wide range of possible social actions that could be taken to address the **current** issue of **people's changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity**;
- ▶ explain, in depth, the consequences of each social action;
- ▶ identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument. (Note: That the use of perspectives is not required in this task.)

CONDITIONS

Students will have two hours **under open book test conditions** to complete Tasks 1 and 2.

TASK 1 (assessed)

Possible social actions and the consequences of these actions. (Note: The use of Social Studies perspectives is required in this task.) Use the Task 1 Template plus your own paper.

TASK 2 (assessed)

Identification of the preferred Social Action and the reasons for its selection. (Note: The use of Social Studies perspectives is not required in this task.) Use the Task 2 Template.

Note: If students have to do Tasks 1 and 2 in separate time slots then **all written material must stay in the classroom**.

OVERVIEW

There has been a lot of discussion about **whether it is appropriate to keep dolphins and whales in captivity** in the local news media.

Your task is to:

- ▶ suggest a wide range of possible social actions that could be taken to address the **current** issue of **keeping dolphins and whales in captivity (in aquaria)**;
- ▶ explain, in depth, the consequences of each social action;
- ▶ identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.

You have **two hours** in class to complete Tasks 1 and 2. (Note: All your work must remain in the classroom if two one-hour time slots are used.)

You are to hand in **all your written material**.

Start by reading **all** the instructions and check with your teacher that you have understood the requirements of the tasks.



© Melissa Schalke

TASK 1 (assessed) SEE TEMPLATE PAGE 27

State a wide range of possible social actions in relation to a social issue and explain, in depth, their likely consequences.

You need to put yourself in the role of **four advocates** (for example, an animal rights campaigner, marine biologist, marine park employee or local tangata te whenua) who have different ideas about what social action(s) should be taken to address this controversial issue.

For each of the four members of society you will need to:

- a) state a possible social action that **you** think could be undertaken.
- b) describe the consequences of this social action (you need to use a perspective to help explain the consequences of the action).

TASK 2 (assessed) SEE TEMPLATE PAGE 28

Identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument. To do this you will use the Task 2 Template to:

- a) state the **action** or actions you would most **prefer** to see taken.
- b) justify your choice(s) by:
 - ▶ giving **at least two** social, political, economic, humanitarian, long-term **or** short-term reasons for your choice.
 - ▶ including **specific evidence and Social Studies concepts** that support your choices and reasons. (Note that the use of Social Studies perspectives is not required in this task.)

Make sure you link reasons and evidence together in a **logical sequence** to build a reasoned argument for the action(s) you have stated that you would prefer to see taken.

ENTERTAINERS, TEACHERS OR SLAVES? DOLPHINS AND WHALES IN AQUARIA

TEACHING AND LEARNING ACTIVITIES



TASK 1 TEMPLATE

DESCRIPTION OF ADVOCATE:

NAME:

ETHNICITY:

AGE:

OCCUPATION:

SOCIO-ECONOMIC GROUP:

STANCE ON THIS ISSUE:

SOCIAL ACTION:

SOCIAL STUDIES CONCEPTS THAT I WILL USE TO EXPLAIN IN DEPTH THE CONSEQUENCES OF THE PROPOSED SOCIAL ACTION:

SOCIAL STUDIES PERSPECTIVE THAT I WILL USE TO EXPLAIN THE CONSEQUENCES OF THE PROPOSED SOCIAL ACTION:

a) Proposed Social Action =

b) Consequences of this social action (include the Social Studies concepts and perspectives that you have listed in the boxes above.)

Teacher will need to provide Template 1 for three social actions to support students who are stating a range of possible social actions.

REPEAT THIS TASK USING THE SAME FORMAT FOR ADVOCATES 2, 3 AND 4.

ENTERTAINERS, TEACHERS OR SLAVES?

DOLPHINS AND WHALES IN AQUARIA

TEACHING AND LEARNING ACTIVITIES



ASSESSMENT SCHEDULE: SocStud/1/5_gen1: GENERIC - SOCIAL ACTION

TASK 1

Achievement Standard 90219 v3 - Decide on social action(s) in relation to a social issue. The evidence outlined here is based on the current issue of the changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity as a means of showcasing different social actions that may be possible.

JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT	JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH MERIT	JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH EXCELLENCE
<p>STUDENTS WILL ... State possible social actions in relation to people's changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity and identify their likely consequences.</p> <p>'Identify' means students will mention some appropriate consequences.</p> <p>'Consequences' could include short-term, long-term, social or economic effects.</p>	<p>STUDENTS WILL ... State a range of possible social actions in relation to people's changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity and explain their likely consequences.</p> <p>A 'range' means at least three possible social actions.</p> <p>'Explain' means students will give details of some appropriate consequences.</p>	<p>STUDENTS WILL ... State a wide range of possible social actions in relation to people's changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity and explain, in depth, their likely consequences.</p> <p>A 'wide range' means at least four possible social actions.</p> <p>'In depth' means students will show a clear understanding of more than one Social Studies concept (which could include: accessibility, ahi kā, change, distance, interaction, location, urbanisation, resource, place, natural and cultural features, conservation, environment, perception, competition, whenua and tūrangawaewae) in their explanations as well as giving more than one example of people's perspectives on this current issue.</p>
EVIDENCE STATEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT	EVIDENCE STATEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH MERIT	EVIDENCE STATEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH EXCELLENCE
<p>Students will have stated at least TWO possible social actions that link to people's changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity and mentioned at least two consequences. See sample answers.</p> <p><i>Actions: There must be at least two of the following actions.</i></p>	<p>Students will have stated at least THREE possible social actions that link to people's changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity and explained at least three likely consequences. See sample answers.</p> <p><i>Actions: As per the evidence for Achievement but there must be three actions.</i></p>	<p>Students will have stated at least FOUR possible social actions that link to people's changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity and included more than one Social Studies concept and more than one perspective on this current issue in explaining likely consequences.</p> <p><i>Actions: As per the evidence for Achievement with Merit but four actions required.</i></p>
JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT	JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH MERIT	JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH EXCELLENCE
<p>STUDENTS WILL ... Identify, with reason(s), the preferred action(s).</p>	<p>STUDENTS WILL ... Identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.</p> <p>Justify means giving reasons that may be social, political, economic, humanitarian, long-term or short-term.</p> <p>With reasoned argument means students will link their reasons logically together and support their decision about a preferred action(s) with evidence. (Note: The use of Social Studies perspectives is not required in this task.)</p>	<p>STUDENTS WILL ... Identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.</p> <p>Justify means giving reasons that may be social, political, economic, humanitarian, long-term or short-term.</p> <p>With reasoned argument means students will link their reasons logically together and support their decision about a preferred action(s) with evidence. (Note: The use of Social Studies perspectives is not required in this task.)</p>

ENTERTAINERS, TEACHERS OR SLAVES? DOLPHINS AND WHALES IN AQUARIA

TEACHING AND LEARNING ACTIVITIES



ASSESSMENT SCHEDULE: SocStud/1/5_genI: GENERIC - SOCIAL ACTION

TASK 2

Achievement Standard 90219 v3 - Decide on social action(s) in relation to a social issue. The evidence outlined here is based on the current issue of the changing attitudes to the keeping of dolphins and whales in captivity as a means of showcasing different social actions that may be possible.

JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT	JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH MERIT	JUDGEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH EXCELLENCE
<p>STUDENTS WILL ... Identify, with reason(s), the preferred action(s).</p>	<p>STUDENTS WILL ... Identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.</p> <p>Justify means giving reasons that may be social, political, economic, humanitarian, long-term or short-term.</p> <p>With reasoned argument means students will link their reasons logically together and support their decision about a preferred action(s) with evidence. (Note: The use of Social Studies perspectives is not required in this task.)</p>	<p>STUDENTS WILL ... Identify the preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.</p> <p>Justify means giving reasons that may be social, political, economic, humanitarian, long-term or short-term.</p> <p>With reasoned argument means students will link their reasons logically together and support their decision about a preferred action(s) with evidence. (Note: The use of Social Studies perspectives is not required in this task.)</p>
EVIDENCE STATEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT	EVIDENCE STATEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH MERIT	EVIDENCE STATEMENTS FOR ACHIEVEMENT WITH EXCELLENCE
<p>Students will state the preferred action(s) and give at least one reason for this choice.</p>	<p>Students will state their representative's preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.</p>	<p>Students will state their representative's preferred action(s) and justify with reasoned argument.</p>

SUGGESTED TEXTS AND WEB LINKS

EXTENDED WRITTEN TEXTS

NON-FICTION (extracts from)

- 114 "Shamu at Sea World." *Cruising the Performative*. Jane Desmond and Philip Brett. 1995.
- 118 "Paul Spong and Skana." *Kararehe: Animals in New Zealand Art, Story and Everyday Life*. Annie Potts, Philip Armstrong and Deidre Brown. 2010.
- 119 *Whale*. Joe Roman. 2006.

SHORT WRITTEN TEXTS

MAGAZINE

- 128 "The Future of Zoos." *North & South*. Mike White. 2006.

NEWSPAPERS

- 136 "Dolphins – the Flipside of Fun." *Sunday Star-Times*. Claire Guyan. 1995.
- 138 "The Dolphin Dilemma" and "The 'Sick Culture' of Captivity." *Herald on Sunday*. Jane Phare. 2006.
- 139 "End of an Era' as Last Dolphin Dies." *The Dominion Post*. Greer McDonald. 2008.



REPORTS

- 140 *The Case Against Marine Mammals in Captivity*. HSUS and WSPA. 2008.
- 148 *Cetaceans in Captivity*. SAFE Campaign Report. 1999.

WRITTEN AND VISUAL TEXTS

CARTOON

- 151 "Of course, you know I'd rather eat your kid than entertain him, right?" Dan Piraro. 2007.

POSTER

- 152 "Born free – let them swim free." SAFE. 1999.

ELECTRONIC TEXTS

- 153 *SAFE Supporter Bulletin #56*. SAFE. 2008.
- 153 *The Cove*. Oceanic Preservation Society. 2009.

VISUAL AND ORAL TEXTS ON ANIMAL & US DVD

FILM

- Lolita: Slave to Entertainment*. Rattle the Cage Productions. 2003.

CURRENT AFFAIRS

- A Mate for Kelly*. Sunday. 2006.

